



City of Carmel

CARMEL PLAN COMMISSION SPECIAL STUDIES COMMITTEE THURSDAY, MARCH 29, 2007

Members present: Wayne Haney, Kevin Heber, Madeleine Torres (late arrival,) Susan Westermeier

DOCS Staff: Matt Griffin, Christine Barton-Holmes, Rachel Boone

The Special Studies Committee will meet to consider the following items:

1. **Docket No. 07020005 ADLS Amend - Building: Roselli's Pizzeria patio enclosure**
The applicant seeks approval to enclose an existing patio.
The site is located at 4335 West 106th Street, and is zoned B3 within the US 421/Michigan Road Overlay.
Filed by Kellie Malcolm of Peterson Architecture for Roselli's Pizzeria.

Kellie Malcolm, Peterson Architecture appeared before the Committee representing Roselli's Pizzeria. Kellie presented the design shelter for the existing, exterior seating area.

Matt Griffin: The Department has no issues with the design—it is attractive and functional. The Department supports the proposal.

Wayne Haney made formal motion to approve **Docket No. 07020005 ADLS Amend - Building: Roselli's Pizzeria patio enclosure**, seconded by Kevin Heber, **APPROVED 3-0**.

2. **Docket No. 07030027 ADLS Amend: Pearson Ford – Signage**
The applicant seeks approval for new wall signs.
the site is located at 10650 N. Michigan Rd. and is zoned B-3.
Filed by Dave Coots for Coots, Henke & Wheeler.

Dave Coots, Coots Henke & Wheeler appeared before the Commission representing Pearson Ford. A booklet containing renderings of the multiple signs was submitted for consideration and approval, subject to the Board of Zoning Appeals approval of number and size. At the BZA hearing on Monday, March 26th, the BZA declined to grant the additional signs for Cats and Cummins Engines.

The petitioner is seeking approval to replace the “Truck Center” sign with the Auto Credit Builders. Truck Center has moved to the north and will be replaced by Auto Credit Builders.

Auto Credit Builders is a new, totally separate entity, of which Pearson Ford is a part. Pearson Ford will sell used vehicles to credit risks. The size of the Auto Credit Builders sign was approved by BZA; the letters are the same height as the other signs, just more letters.

The Pearson Ford sign on the south side of the Truck Center will be relocated to the north side so that traffic headed south on 421 will see this sign. The Performance Collision Center sign will have their logo added in red maroon. The petitioner is requesting approval of the appearance of the logo.

Department Report, Matt Griffin: There are no issues with the proposed signage; what is presented is a unified sign package. The Department would rather the Auto Credit Builders sign color be blue.

DOCS, Rachel Boone commented that the logo requires a variance for the Performance Collision Center sign.

Matt Griffin agreed to maroon red on the Performance Collision Center logo.

Madeleine Torres made formal motion to approve **Docket No. 07030027 ADLS Amend, Pearson Ford Signage** as presented, seconded by Wayne Haney, Approved 4-0.

3. Docket No. 07030008 ADLS Amend: Midwest ISO – Security Fence

The applicant seeks approval for the construction of perimeter fencing and additional landscaping related to the fence.

The site is located at 701 City Center Drive and is zoned M3/Industrial Park.

Filed by Fred Simmons of Simmons Architects, LLC for Midwest ISO.

Fred Simmons, Simmons Architects appeared before the Committee representing Midwest ISO. The Department of Homeland Security is requesting a security fence be installed at the Midwest ISO facility in Carmel for the purpose of keeping people from entering the property and also protecting the property from vehicles entering at a high rate of speed.

The security fence would not be a typical wrought iron fence; the fence would be 6 feet high, four horizontal bars, a K-8 classification capable of withstanding a 4,000 pound vehicle crashing into it with no penetration.

The gates would be sliding or hydraulic ballards—more aesthetically pleasing than a rolling gate and offers higher security. The building is highly secure, manned and monitored 24 hours per day. There would also be additional berming along Circle Center Drive. Homeland Security recommended an extra-secure fence to protect from bomb blast from a truck or car through the mounding. Midwest ISO will re-grade and relocate planting materials on the property. Drainage is being worked through with the Engineering Dept. The shape of the mounding may modify depending on conversations with Engineering.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin: The Department has no concerns, no issues. The proposal is in response to a sensitive situation and a reality at this point.

Madeleine Torres made formal motion to approve **Docket No. 070300087 ADLS Amend, Midwest ISO Security Fence**, seconded by Wayne Haney, Approved 4-0.

4. **Docket No. 07030017 ADLS Amend: Meridian Mark Plaza – Signage**

The applicant seeks approval to amend their sign package.

The site is located at 11711 N. Meridian St. and is zoned B-6.

Filed by Steve Granner for Bose McKinney & Evans LLP.

Steve Granner, Zoning Consultant, Bose McKinney & Evans, 300 Pennsylvania Parkway appeared before the Committee representing Hewlett Packard and Zeller Properties. A new wall sign is being proposed for the building located at 11711 North Meridian Street.

The proposed wall sign is bronze anodized, and is within the size, lighting, and color guidelines of the Ordinance. The logo is actually the sign and the BZA approved the variance for the logo Monday evening.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin: The Department supports the petitioner's request; the sign meets the sign package.

Madeleine Torres confirmed that the BZA hearing officer approved the variance.

Wayne Haney made formal motion to approve **Docket No. 07030017 ADLS Amend, Meridian Mark Plaza Signage**, seconded by Madeleine Torres, **APPROVED** 4-0.

5. **Docket No. 07030026 ADLS Amend: Hamilton Beverage – Signage**

The applicant seeks approval for two new wall signs.

The site is located at 2290 E. 116th St. and is zoned B-8.

Filed by Mary Solada for Bingham McHale.

Matt Price, attorney, Bingham McHale appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Jay Wiser, Construction Superintendent was also in attendance.

The building located at 2290 East 116th Street, Carmel will be converted from a two-tenant building to a one-tenant building to be occupied solely by Hamilton Beverage. The conversion is part of a remodeling project to provide more storage and increase wine selections. The exterior changes will involve removing one set of entry doors and relocating the entry in the center of the building. With the increased interior space, the inventory will no longer be stacked in the windows.

The petitioner has filed a variance application with the Board of Zoning Appeals for the wall

sign not facing a public right-of-way as well as the size of the signs. The variances were continued and will be reviewed by the BZA on April 23, 2007.

The petitioner is working with the landlord for consent to the proposed changes in the exterior of the building. At this time, the petitioner would like to undertake the remodeling aspect and minimal façade changes of the project under ADLS review and return to the Special Studies Committee with a complete sign package after the BZA meeting on April 23rd. The proposal also up-dates the sign package to conform to the United Package Liquors logo.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin: The Department has no issues with the building renovation and with one unified space. The Department supports the proposed renovation and recommends approval for the changes in façade. The Department is recommending that the sign text utilize one color; the petitioner will return with a complete sign package for approval.

Madeleine Torres commented that there is clutter in the windows and every window has a sign. Overall, it is very busy, a lot going on, and would look more presentable if the windows were cleaned up. Madeleine Torres asked for a commitment from the petitioner to clear the windows.

The petitioner responded that the newspaper boxes are gone, the dumpster is being moved to the west side of the property and will be enclosed with a fence, the coke machines have been reduced in number to two.

Madeleine Torres made formal motion for approval of **Docket No. 07030026 ADLS Amend, Hamilton Beverage Signage conditioned upon** the window signage and newspaper boxes being removed, the vending machines being reduced in number to two, the relocation of the dumpster to the west side (dumpster to be enclosed with a fence) and the remodeling and minimal changes proposed in the façade. The petitioner will return for a complete sign package after review by the BZA in April. The motion was seconded by Wayne Haney and **Approved 4-0**.

6. Docket No. 07010009 DP/ADLS: Sunrise of Carmel

The applicant seeks to construct a 4-story, 150,802 square foot independent and assisted living facility on 4.10 acres.

The site is located at the northeast corner of Old Meridian Street and US 31, and is zoned B6 within the US 31 Overlay.

Filed by Mary Solada of Bingham McHale LLP for Sunrise Development, Inc.

Docket No. 07020006 Zoning Waiver: Sunrise of Carmel

The applicant seeks a waiver to increase the Floor Area Ratio from 0.70 to 0.84, a 20% increase, in the construction of a 4-story continuing care facility with underground parking.

The site is located at the northeast corner of Old Meridian Street and US 31, and is zoned B6 within the US 31 Overlay.

Filed by Mary Solada of Bingham McHale LLP for Sunrise Development, Inc

Matt Price, attorney, Bingham McHale appeared before the Committee representing the

applicant. Also in attendance: Tim Hedges, Sunrise Development, Jack Scott, architect, Ashton Fritz and Gary Murray, Schneider Engineering.

Matt Price commented that the last committee meeting focused on presenting sketches of the US 31 elevation and the petitioner was asked to detail the elements of the façade that showed a more urban character and a more suburban character. The petitioner was asked to return to this meeting to show other elevations from the US 31 side and other elevations. Photographs of the interior of the buildings were also presented. Landscaping and outdoor amenities were also discussed; the petitioner was asked to add landscaping and to identify more outdoor amenities as a part of this proposal.

Jack Scott addressed the Committee – the elevations have been revised in response to comments made by the Committee. Roofs: The massive portion—the highlighted ends—the slope has been increased as well as the wall quality on the elevation for the creation of perception of height. The buildings have greater depth in the gable faces; the center piece and ends are maximized and varied.

Elements: There is real differentiation in color of brick—deeper and lighter—and matched with pre-cast lentils at the top of the windows. Segmental arches have been added in the porch areas. There is a Flemish bond patterning in the gabled area.

On the east side, there are variations using the same elements—highlighting the center section, the entry area. The tower element matches or balances the element with the open porches, using deeper field of brick color with more pale/beige brick. The north and south elevations highlight the assisted living area. The independent living has a more certain rhythm in mass and system; the entry area is still highlighted.

Site: The area between the building and US 31 provides benches all around the walkway system that extends around the building. There are four (4) steps down to a terrace or patio area for each resident. The Fire Marshall accepted sub-turf structure to allow an all-green area for emergency access. The total environment inside and out has a continuous walking loop with benches, sitting areas, trellis areas, bird feeders, and a vegetable garden. There are outdoor balconies on the third and fourth floors. The Gazebo has been shifted closer to the walk/multi use path.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin: The petitioner has made a lot of changes in small, detail elements and has come a long way. One of the biggest changes is the standing seam metal roof as opposed to shingles, and will blend and tie into the Old Meridian flavor. More texture and detail are shown in the drawings; the materials are similar to the building. The retaining wall is two-three feet tall maximum and is not visible from US 31 because of the grade. At this time, the Department definitely supports the project with the changes made to date.

Christine Barton-Holmes: The south elevation shows dark areas under the windows—petitioner states they are mechanical units. One tower on the south elevation is below the eaves, all other above—petitioner will draw the tower up and even with the others. Regarding the site plan—the

wheelchair ramp should feed at 93 degree angle—it is much safer.

Committee comments/questions:

Wayne Haney asked about the walk on the north end of the independent living—is it a ramp? Petitioner responded that it is not a ramp per se, but rather is an exit stair with a walk to the first floor level. How many elevators? Petitioner states there are two elevators, one inside, one outside. How many parking spaces are provided; how many persons in the independent living units—how many in the assisted living? Petitioner states there are 109 parking spaces; there are 62 independent living units and 78 assisted living units. The garage spaces number 36 or 38 and are located underground. Wayne Haney asked about kitchen deliveries—into a garage and up an elevator? Petitioner states that deliveries are made at ground level, onto a ramp, then to a service elevator.

Madeleine Torres asked about the one-story kitchen connector, whether or not it could be dressed up and if it is a necessity.

Jack Scott responded that the one story kitchen connector is a necessity and is an operational issue—the commercial kitchen is housed there. The connector kitchen serves both buildings and is the top of the garage as well. It is approximately 1,500 to 2,000 square feet and will not be seen from the west elevation (from US 31) because of the berm.

Torres, how will trucks enter, and where is the kitchen delivery? What about the trash enclosure?

Jack Scott responded that the trucks will enter from the low grade parking area—the slope is on the side. Ordinarily there is a trash compactor—it is collected inside—there is no outside trash dumpster area.

Susan Westermeier asked about access for ambulances—Matt Griffin said he must rely on the fires marshall—if he has no issues and supports the layout, the Department would also support.

Kevin Heber asked about the multi-use path—it serves Old Meridian and should be ten (10) feet wide. Kevin said he would like to see the path pulled in and a little grass between the curb and the path. Matt Griffin said the City would pick up the path after leaving the northern terminus and finish to the round about; the balance of the walk would be six feet wide, concrete construction.

Matt Griffin stated no issues with the zoning waivers.

Susan Westermeier asked about the outdoor garden area—how big and is it fenced. Jack Scott said the outdoor garden area is centrally located along the north side with a four-foot high fence, low profile area, gate on either side, controlled area with landscaping and benches.

Susan Westermeier also asked about outdoor balconies. Jack Scott said there are actually terraces on the first floor and fourth floor for residents who cannot get out and walk by

themselves. The communal area has the terraces—not assisted living units.

Matt Griffin reported that in regard to the lighting, the Department is at an impasse. There is a string of lights around entry points and the Department does not feel strongly. If the lighting is contained and downlit, it is OK. The photometric plan complies with the US 31 Overlay.

Susan Wetermeier noted that some people not on the committee had issues with the project and wanted more detail, more pattern, better design, and wanted to prevent Alzheimer's people from walking into the street.

Tim Hedges said the Alzheimer's is a secure, locked area on the fourth floor—it is unlikely anyone would wander off.

Wayne Haney said he was comfortable with the interior of the facility as shown.

Madeleine Torres made formal motion to forward Docket No. 07010009 DP/ADLS, DP/ADLS, Sunrise of Carmel, and Docket No. 07020006 Zoning Waiver, Sunrise of Carmel to the Plan Commission with a favorable recommendation with the commitment of no outdoor dumpster area and a 10-foot wide path at the north end, seconded by Wayne Haney, Approved 4-0.

7. Docket No. 07020012 Z: 1328-1440 W. Main Street Rezone

The applicant seeks to create to rezone property from OM/SU and S2 within the US 31 Overlay to B6 within the US 31 Overlay.

The site is located at the NE corner of US 31 (Meridian) and W. Main Street and is zoned Old Meridian Special Use (OMSU), S2, and is within the US 31 Overlay.

Filed by Eugene Valanzano of Baker and Daniels for Browning Real Estate Partners and the City of Carmel

Jamie Browning, Browning Real Estate Partners appeared before the Committee representing Browning Real Estate Partners and the City of Carmel. The subject site contains 20 acres located at US 31 and Old Meridian, currently owned by St. Christopher's Church.

The petitioner is applying for a change in zoning from OM/SU and S-2 to B-6 Business within the US 31 Overlay District. The B-6 zoning complies with the Carmel Comprehensive Plan. Currently there are conflicting zones and does not allow for residential.

Jamie Browning distributed a preliminary site plan for the Committee. The proposal is for mixed use with hotel, or small retail with offices above. There would be office-type uses or other, to be determined. It is likely that some of the property will be conveyed to another party. Browning Investments will probably put in the roads and drainage.

The petitioner has met with the TAC committee to discuss road and the drainage area has been studied. The petitioner has talked with the County Surveyor and Engineering; the road aligns with the new Grand Boulevard and Pennsylvania Street on 131st Street.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin: At this stage, the request is a rezone only. The

Department is working with the applicant—a lot of issues are still being worked out. In terms of straight rezone, the Department is in full support—the proposal complies with the Comprehensive Plan for the City.

Madeleine Torres asked about the roads—the connectivity of US 31—and future plans.

Matt Griffin responded that there was some discussion about what would happen with US 31 and what INDOT will do in the future. In terms of Carmel streets, the City Engineer is comfortable in continuing to work with the applicant. Whatever the City does, INDOT will do what needs to be done at this intersection—a lot of it is

Mike Hollibaugh reported that at one point, a bridge was proposed over 31, the thoroughfare plan amended and the extension eliminated. At a Plan Commission presentation, that information was obsolete. Currently, there is no plan for a bridge of any kind; roundabouts will suffice and facilitate traffic.

Kevin Heber made formal motion to forward Docket No. 07020012 Z, 1328-1440 West Main Street Rezone to the full Plan Commission with a favorable recommendation, seconded by Madeleine Torres, approved 4-0.

There was no further business to come before the Committee and the meeting adjourned at 7:45 PM.

Susan Westermeier, Acting Chairperson

Ramona Hancock, Secretary